

The following pages contain reproductions of emails between Steven Druker and Jose Luis Morán López, President of the Mexican Academy of Sciences (AMC), and Francisco Bolívar Zapata, coordinator of the AMC's Biotechnology Committee, in connection with Druker's challenge to the Academy issued 14 November 2018. All three men wrote their emails in English.

Below is the email Druker sent to Dr. Morán on Nov. 14th along with his formal challenge:

Dear Doctor Morán,

On October 2nd, I sent a letter to Dr. Francisco Bolívar Zapata informing him that the book produced by the AMC that he coordinated, titled *Transgénicos*, contains several false and defamatory allegations about me and my book, *Altered Genes, Twisted Truth*. You were sent a copy of that letter, as was Dr. Octavio Ramírez Reivich, one of the members of the AMC Biotechnology Committee who collaborated on *Transgénicos*.

Although I requested that Dr. Bolívar Zapata attempt to substantiate those allegations, his reply of October 10th ignored my request and instead instructed me to read *Transgénicos* and the publications upon which it is based so that I could become "properly informed" about "the innocuousness" of GMOs.

In my response to him of October 11th, on which you and Dr. Ramírez Reivich were again copied, I pointed out that if he had fully read my book, which should have been done before attacking it, he would have known that I have extensively studied the published scientific research and also the major books and reports that argue for the safety of GMOs; and he would additionally have known that my book demonstrates how those books and reports — including reports by the US National Academy of Sciences and the UK Royal Society — are significantly based on factual distortions.

Because two of the most prominent authors of the AMC's book have disregarded my request that they try to substantiate its defamatory allegations about my book, I must now take a stronger step. I am no longer merely requesting that some prominent members of the AMC do this, I am *challenging* the AMC as an institution to do it — and I demand a retraction and a formal apology if the challenge cannot be met. The detailed challenge is attached in both English and Spanish, and Dr. Bolívar Zapata and six other members of the AMC Biotechnology Committee are receiving copies.

In his email of October 10th, Dr. Bolívar Zapata stated that he would read and comment on additional information he receives from me "in the best scientific and academic spirit." I hope that you, he, and the Biotechnology Committee will read and respond to my challenge in this spirit, displaying the open-mindedness and the willingness to acknowledge mistakes that are essential for scientific progress.

Please confirm your receipt of this challenge.

Steven M. Druker

Executive Director
Alliance for Bio-Integrity

On November 20, Dr. Morán replied as follows:

Dear Dr. Druker,

I acknowledge receipt of your e-mail.

I have appointed Dr. Francisco G. Bolívar, former President of the Mexican Academy of Sciences (MAS), Coordinator of the MAS Biotechnology Committee and Coordinator of the book *Transgénicos*, to answer your e-mail.

Sincerely,

Dr. José-Luis Morán-López
President
Mexican Academy of Sciences

On November 21, Dr. Bolívar sent Druker the following email:

Hello Steven,

We have received instructions from Dr. Moran about a document you wrote to him as President of the Mexican Academy of Sciences with copies to several members of the Biotechnology Committee of AMC.

With the support of some of my colleagues, I will write the answer to your document.

Best regards,
Francisco Bolivar

On 17 January 2019, Druker sent the following email to Morán and Bolívar:

Dear Dr. Morán and Dr. Bolívar,

I hope that 2019 has begun well for you and that it will be a year of progress for the AMC and for Mexico. I'm writing to inquire how much more time you estimate it will take before I receive a formal response to the challenge I conveyed on November 14th. Dr. Morán, you informed me that you had assigned that task to Dr. Bolívar; and you, Dr. Bolívar, subsequently informed me that you and some colleagues on the AMC Biotechnology Committee would be preparing the reply.

Both deadlines specified in the challenge have expired, and it's now been more than a month since the second set of replies was due. However, although the AMC has failed to meet the challenge within the deadlines, for the sake of science, I think it's imperative that the team of AMC experts continue to scrutinize my book for inaccurate assertions of fact and that they send me a formal report of their findings — and that if they cannot back up their negative allegations about my book, they issue a formal apology and retraction. I think it is also necessary for them to

respond to the demand that they try to justify the deficient and misleading account of the long-term Séralini study that appears in their book, *Transgénicos*.

Further, it is by now obvious that none of the authors of *Transgénicos* had fully read my book before alleging that it contains many false statements (including some lies), because if even one person had actually read the book, and if it really contained many false assertions, he or she would have been able to provide a list of at least three within the time period specified in the challenge — and certainly before today. Therefore, it's reasonable to assume that the authors obtained their erroneous impression from some website or article that contains false allegations about my book. Accordingly, I request that you inform me of the specific source (or sources) of that misinformation so that I can take steps to set the record straight.

When I transmitted my challenge, I noted that you, Dr. Bolívar, had stated that you would read and comment on information you receive from me "in the best scientific and academic spirit." And I expressed the hope that you and the Biotechnology Committee would read and respond to my challenge in this spirit, displaying the open-mindedness and the willingness to acknowledge mistakes that are essential for scientific progress.

I continue to hope that will be the case.

Steven Druker

On Jan. 21, Bolívar replied as follows:

Hello Steven Druker

We are working in the response of the Committee.

Best regards

Francisco Bolivar

On 8 July 2019, Druker sent the following email (which continues on the next page) to Morán and Bolívar. As of July 31, neither has sent a reply.

Dear Dr. Morán and Dr. Bolívar,

On January 17th, I sent you an email that's attached to this one as a PDF. Please read it again, because it is even more relevant today, and an adequate response is more urgently required. The only reply I have yet received was sent by you, Dr. Bolívar, on January 21st, in which you stated that the response of the AMC Biotechnology Committee to my challenge was being worked on.

Because you and several members of that Committee have been scrutinizing my book for more than seven months but have not yet demonstrated even one instance in which it makes an inaccurate factual assertion, the compelling conclusion is that you have not found any.

Therefore, you must confront a crucial question:

Regarding the issue of genetically modified foods, are the members of the Biotechnology Committee prepared to act like responsible scientists or will they behave like unprincipled propagandists? Do they have the integrity, and sufficient commitment to science, to admit that they were wrong and to apologize for their false and unjust allegations about me and my book, or are they so strongly committed to defending the image of GMOs that they are willing to sacrifice their integrity by trying to maintain the deception that their book, *Transgénicos*, is fully accurate and that my book is the one that repeatedly misrepresents facts?

I hope the answer is the one of which you can be proud, especially considering that you, Dr. Bolívar, previously pledged that you would proceed “in the best scientific and academic spirit.”

Accordingly, I demand that before July 16th the AMC issue an official apology

- a. admitting that, in attempting to respond to my challenge, its Biotechnology Committee has not been able to discern any inaccurate assertions of fact in my book;**
- b. acknowledging that the Committee has not been able to justify the way in which *Transgénicos* treated the Séralini study — because it could not refute the assertions of fact made in my book about that study; and**
- c. acknowledging that there was no sound basis for any of the disparaging allegations about me and my book that were made in *Transgénicos* — and pledging to promptly retract them from the online versions of that book and to exclude them from all future printed editions.**

Moreover, because it’s obvious that those allegations were not based on anything written in my book, I renew the request in my email of January 17th that the Committee inform me of the specific source (or sources) of the misinformation so that I can take steps to set the record straight.

I also extend an offer to be a speaker at an AMC conference and to engage in respectful dialogue with members who wish to challenge any of my assertions. I have been invited to make presentations at many eminent universities (including Harvard, Cornell, Columbia, and the University of Copenhagen), and I would welcome the opportunity for such interaction with your members. I’m confident that it would be an illuminating experience for all of us.

I look forward to your response — and to proceeding in the spirit of science.

Steven Druker